
MEETING	SCRUTINY MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE
DATE	25 SEPTEMBER 2006
PRESENT	COUNCILLORS KIRK (CHAIR), MERRETT (VICE-CHAIR), CUTHBERTSON, HILL, HYMAN, LIVESLEY AND B WATSON (AS SUBSTITUTE FOR COUNCILLOR BLANCHARD)
APOLOGIES	COUNCILLOR BLANCHARD
IN ATTENDANCE	COUNCILLOR D'AGORNE

1. **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

At this point in the meeting, the Chair invited declarations of interest in any business on the agenda and none were declared.

2. **MINUTES**

The minutes of the meetings of the Scrutiny Management Committee were approved as a correct record and signed by the Chair.

3. **PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

The Chair reported that no registrations had been made to speak at the meeting under the Council's Public Participation Scheme.

4. **SCHEDULE OF REGISTERED SCRUTINY TOPICS AVAILABLE FOR REVIEW**

(a) **Topic 135 – Highways Maintenance Procurement Process**

Members reconsidered the original topic registration form submitted by Councillor Simpson-Laing in relation to the above proposed review, together with the accompanying feasibility study. The Chair reminded Members that at this stage they were merely being asked to consider whether the topic was worthy of inclusion on the schedule of topics under (c) below available for potential review.

Councillor Simpson-Laing attended the meeting to support her case for review and explain why a review would, in her opinion, be invaluable to assist the procurement process. The Head of Highway Infrastructure attended the meeting to update Members on progress with the current and ongoing related PFI bid.

Members supported adding the topic to the schedule on the basis that Councillor Simpson-Laing be asked to review her topic registration and update it to reflect the current PFI status and ensure that any review would be relevant in the current situation.

RESOLVED:

That topic 135 – Highways Maintenance Procurement Process – be added to the schedule of topics available for review under (c) below, subject to Councillor Simpson-Laing making the above revisions to the registration form.

(b) Topic 129 Local Transport Plan 2:

Members reconsidered the original topic registration by Councillor Simpson-Laing and its accompanying feasibility study with a view to deciding whether to include the topic in the schedule under (c) below for potential review. Councillor Simpson-Laing attended the meeting to support her topic registration.

Members discussed in some detail whether to include the topic on the schedule and decided to defer consideration to the next meeting, with a view to inviting the Executive Member to attend to explain the processes and the involvement of Members in determining the strategy and delivery programme for LTP2.

RESOLVED:

That topic 129 – Local Transport Plan 2 – be deferred to the next meeting to invite the Executive Member to attend and clarify the position, prior to any decision being made on whether to add the topic to the schedule for potential review.

(c) Schedule of Registered Scrutiny Topics:

Members considered a schedule of registered scrutiny topics for potential allocation to review, including the highways maintenance procurement process. They considered the schedule, topic by topic, having regard to the available registration forms and feasibility studies and decided to allocate Ad-hoc Scrutiny Sub-Committees to deal with the following 2 topics:

- Review of Council-owned land in the area of Tang Hall school;
- Highway Maintenance Procurement Process

In addition, Members agreed the following:

To refer the topic on the evaluation of domiciliary and recuperative care for older people in the York area to the Health Scrutiny Committee for consideration;

To defer consideration of the following to the next meeting, alongside LTP2:

- Traffic Congestion in York (No.120);

To retain the following on the schedule of registered topics with a view to reconsidering them as other reviews progress:

- Suburban Shopping Centres (No. 109); and
- Key strategic partnership working (No. 138)

To invite the relevant EMAP (Leisure & Culture) to consider the basis for the topic on public art (No. 137) with a view to pursuing implementation of the underlying policy; and

To reject the following registered topics still on the schedule:

- Parking charges in York (No. 121);
- Transitional services from education environment to independent living for adults with learning disabilities (No. 126);

RESOLVED:

That (1) Ad-hoc Scrutiny Sub-Committees be established and remits be prepared for approval, in consultation with the Chair, Vice-Chair and Green spokesperson, in relation to:

- Tang Hall School area – Council owned land; and
- Highways maintenance procurement process;

That (2) reconsideration be given at the next meeting to the topics relating to LTP2 and traffic congestion in York, with the Executive Member for City Strategy being invited to attend as above;

That (3) the topic on public arts be referred to the Executive Member Advisory Panel for Leisure & Culture;

That (4) all other topics discussed be either retained for future consideration, rejected or referred to Health Scrutiny Committee as set out above.

5. REDUCING CARBON EMISSIONS SCRUTINY SUB-COMMITTEE - FINAL REPORT

Members considered the final report of the Reducing Carbon Emissions Scrutiny Ad-hoc Sub-Committee incorporating the changes referred to at the last meeting and specifically incorporating the comments of relevant officers, received late and circulated after the agenda had been published. It was felt that those comments – and particularly those regarding financial implications – did not fully address the financial concepts for generating energy savings within the report. As such, Members wished the Director of Resources and/or Assistant Director (Housing) to report back with revised comments or attend the next meeting of SMC to account for the comments made.

RESOLVED:

That the report be not considered by the Executive until further revised comments or an account of those submitted had been received from the Director of Resources and/or Assistant Director (Housing) at the next meeting, as indicated above.

6. RECYCLING & RE-USE SCRUTINY - FINAL REPORT

Members considered the final report of the Recycling & Re-Use Ad-hoc Scrutiny Sub-Committee relating to the removal of bulky items from the waste stream. The Chair of the Ad-hoc Sub-Committee informed Members of a number of amendments made to the final report by the Sub-Committee which had not been included in the version published with the agenda for this meeting, due to the Sub-Committee meeting being held after publication of the agenda. It was suggested that the revisions be incorporated into the final report and recirculated to Members.

Members also wished to add a further recommendation from Scrutiny Management Committee regarding the provision for residents to re-use recycling materials taken to waste collection sites. It was suggested that it would be helpful if space was made available at sites to allow for the inspection of clean materials for a short period of time for suitability for re-use, prior to disposal.

RESOLVED:

That (1) the revisions referred to above be made to the final report for circulation to Members of Scrutiny Management Committee and prior to its consideration by the Executive; and

That (2) an additional recommendation arising from the consideration of Scrutiny Management Committee be referred to the Executive as set out above and relating to provision for residents to re-use clean waste materials.

Councillor Kirk, Chair

[The meeting started at 5.00 pm and finished at 8.10 pm].